

Orthodoxy and Heterodoxy
PART TWO
Roman Catholicism

I. Introduction: Did the Great Schism produce different religions?

II. The Differences in *Phronema* (Mindset)

- A. Development of Doctrine
- B. Faith and Reason
- C. Spirituality

III. Doctrinal Differences

- A. Papal Dogmas and the Church
 - 1. Universal Jurisdiction
 - 2. Papal Infallibility
- B. The Same God?
 - 1. The *Filioque*
 - 2. Divine Simplicity
 - 3. Created Grace
- C. Salvation
 - 1. Can Orthodox Christians and other Non-Catholics be saved?
 - 2. Original Sin
 - 3. Merit, Satisfaction, Eternal Punishment and Temporal Punishment
 - 4. Purgatory and Indulgences
 - 5. Sacraments and Validity

IV. The Grounds of Union

Timeline of Major Dates for Orthodox / Roman Catholic Relations

- ca. 37-53 Episcopacy of St. Peter in Antioch.
- 50 Apostolic Council of Jerusalem overrules St. Peter's Judaizing.
- 64 Martyrdom of St. Peter in Rome.
- 67 Election of St. Linus, first bishop of Rome.
- 135 First recorded use of title *Pope* by a Roman bishop (Hyginus).
- 255 St. Cyprian of Carthage rejects Pope Stephen I's ruling on the Donatist controversy.
- 325 Original Nicene Creed ratified at First Ecumenical Council.
- 330 Founding of Constantinople as New Rome, renaming the city of Byzantium.
- 357 Pope Liberius signs Semi-Arian creed (possibly under duress).
- 379 Emperor Gratian permits Roman pope authority over neighboring bishops.
- 381 Nicene Creed expanded at Second Ecumenical Council.
- 382 First use of papal title *Pontifex Maximus* (formerly a pagan religious title reserved to the emperor).
- 410 Rome sacked by Visigoth invaders.
- 417 Pope Zosimus waffles on Pelagianism.
- 451 Fourth Ecumenical Council notes that Rome's primacy is because it was "the imperial city"; *Tome* of Pope St. Leo I endorsed by Council after review.
- 455 Rome sacked by Vandals.
- ca. 537 Pope Vigilius allegedly writes letter endorsing Monophysitism.
- 589 Insertion of *Filioque* into Nicene Creed by local council in Toledo, Spain.
- ca. 590-604 Pope St. Gregory the Great rejects the title of "universal bishop" for any bishop.
- 680-681 Sixth Ecumenical Council anathematizes Pope Honorius as a Monothelite heretic.
- 710 Last papal visit to Constantinople until 1967.
- ca. 750 Forging of the *Donation of Constantine*, a false document claiming to be from St. Constantine granting universal secular power to the Pope and his successors.
- 752 Founding of Papal States (lasting until 1870).
- 792 Charlemagne accuses "Greeks" of deleting *Filioque* from original Creed.
- 800 Usurpation of Western Roman Empire by Charlemagne.
- 809 Pope Leo III forbids addition of *Filioque* to Creed and has original Creed in both Greek and Latin inscribed on silver tablets displayed in Rome.
- 869-870 Council in Constantinople deposes St. Photius the Great.
- 879-880 Council in Constantinople (endorsed by papacy) reinstates St. Photius and anathematizes any changes to Nicene Creed, including the *Filioque*.
- 962 Founding of Holy Roman Empire.
- 1014 First use of *Filioque* by Pope of Rome, at coronation of Holy Roman Emperor Henry II.
- 1054 Excommunication of Ecumenical Patriarch Michael Cerularius by Cardinal Humbertus, papal legate, the conventional date point of the Great Schism. Michael returns the favor by excommunicating the Pope (who had died rendering his legate's authority null).
- 1059 Beginning of the use of the term *transubstantiation*.
- 1066 Invasion of England by Duke William of Normandy, carrying papal banner and with papal blessing as a crusade against the "erring English church," engineered by Hildebrand, archdeacon of Rome.

- 1073-1085 Hildebrand becomes Pope Gregory VII and institutes Gregorian Reforms, the largest increase of papal power in history, including the claim to be able to depose secular rulers.
- 1075 Pope Gregory VII issues *Dictatus papae*, an extreme statement of papal power.
- 1095-1272 Crusades promise salvation to warriors from the West.
- 1180 Last formal reception of Latins to communion at an Orthodox altar, in Antioch.
- 1182 Maronites (formerly Monothelite heretics) submit to Rome.
- 1204 Fourth Crusade sacks Constantinople; Crusaders set up Latin Empire and Patriarchate of Constantinople (lasting until 1261).
- 1274 Council of Lyons fails to force Orthodox capitulation to papacy.
- 1287 Last record of Benedictine monastery on Mount Athos.
- 1302 Papal bull *Unam Sanctam* declares submission to pope necessary for salvation.
- 1379 Beginning of Western “Great Schism,” during which there are eventually 3 rival popes.
- 1341-1351 Councils in Constantinople vindicate Palamite theology of hesychasm against Barlaamist philosophy.
- 1414-1418 Council of Constance ends Western “Great Schism.”
- 1439 Council of Florence fails to force Orthodox capitulation to papacy and confesses Purgatory as dogma.
- 1444 Catholic priest Lorenzo Valla proves *Donation of Constantine* a forgery.
- 1453 Fall of Constantinople to Ottoman Turks; numerous Greek scholars flee to West, triggering European Renaissance.
- 1545-63 Council of Trent answers charges of Protestant Reformation.
- 1582 Institution of Gregorian Calendar.
- 1596 Union of Brest-Litovsk, creation of the Unia (Eastern/Byzantine/Greek Catholics).
- 1724 Melkite Schism, in which many Antiochian Orthodox become Greek Catholics.
- 1854 Declaration of Immaculate Conception of Mary as dogma.
- 1870 Declaration of Papal Infallibility to be dogma at First Vatican Council.
- 1946 State-sponsored synod held Ukraine dissolves the Union of Brest-Litovsk and integrates the Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church into the Russian Orthodox Church, with Soviet authorities arresting resisters or deporting them to Siberia.
- 1950 Declaration of Bodily Assumption of Mary as dogma.
- 1962-1965 Vatican II institutes major reforms, especially liturgical, into Roman Catholic Church.
- 1964 Mutual lifting of excommunications by Patr. Athenagoras I and Pope Paul VI.
- 1979 Joint Commission of Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches for Theological Dialogue established.
- 1995 Pope John Paul II issues *Orientalis Lumen*, encouraging East-West union.
- 2001 Pope John Paul II apologizes to Orthodox for Fourth Crusade.
- 2004 Return of relics of Ss. John Chrysostom and Gregory the Theologian returned to Constantinople from Rome (after having been stolen by Crusaders).
- 2006 Pope Benedict XVI drops title *Patriarch of the West*.

The Grounds of Union

In order for the Orthodox Church to accept sacramental communion with the Roman Catholic Church, that is, for Roman Catholics to be readmitted into the Orthodox Church, they have to repudiate and reject (not merely brush aside or “theologize around”) the following:

1. Papal Universal Jurisdiction
2. Papal Infallibility
3. Papal Petrine exclusivism (i.e., that only the Pope is Peter’s successor)
4. Development of Doctrine
5. The *Filioque*
6. Original Sin understood as guilt transmitted via “propagation”
7. The Immaculate Conception of Mary
8. Divine Simplicity
9. Merit and Satisfaction soteriology
10. Purgatory and Indulgences
11. Created grace

Roman Catholics would have to accept and fully confess:

1. The authority of Ecumenical Councils over the Pope
2. The Essence/Energies distinction

Roman Catholics would have to restore Orthodox practices (already present for Eastern Catholics):

1. Reconnect Confirmation/Chrismation back to Baptism rather than delaying it
2. Give Holy Communion to all Church members, including infants

In other words, what the Orthodox expect of Roman Catholics is that they become Orthodox again, that they return to the ancient Orthodox faith of the pre-Schism West. They would not have to give up their ancient traditions of worship (though they would probably want to turn the clock back on the liturgical revolution following Vatican II).

Appendix: Further Reading

A. Orthodox Sources

Books

- Carlton, Clark. *The Truth: What Every Roman Catholic Should Know About the Orthodox Church*. Salisbury, MA: Regina Orthodox Press, 1999.
- Clement, Olivier. *You Are Peter: An Orthodox Reflection on the Exercise of Papal Primacy*. New City Press, 2003.
- Guettée, Abbé. *The Papacy: Its Historic Origin and Primitive Relations*.
- Meyendorff, John, ed. *The Primacy of Peter: Essays in Ecclesiology and the Early Church*. Crestwood, New York: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1992.
- Pelikan, Jaroslav. *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine, Vol. 3: The Growth of Medieval Theology (600-1300)*. University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Whelton, Michael. *Popes and Patriarchs: An Orthodox Perspective on Roman Catholic Claims*. Salisbury, MA: Regina Orthodox Press, 2006.
- Whelton, Michael. *Two Paths: Papal Monarchy - Collegial Tradition: Rome's Claim of Papal Supremacy in the Light of Orthodox Teaching*. Salisbury, MA: Regina Orthodox Press, 2001.
- Young, Fr. Alexey. [Various titles, incl. *The Rush to Embrace, The Great Divide and Christianity or Papism?*]

Websites

- For Roman Catholic Inquirers: http://www.orthodoxinfo.com/inquirers/inq_rc.aspx
- The *Filioque*: <http://www.geocities.com/trvalentine/orthodox/filioquemain.html>
- What are the Differences...?: http://www.ocf.org/OrthodoxPage/reading/ortho_cath.html
- The Great Schism: http://www.fatheralexander.org/booklets/english/history_timothy_ware_1.htm#n4

B. Roman Catholic Sources

- Vatican Website: <http://www.vatican.va/>
- Vatican Resource Library: <http://www.vatican.va/archive/index.htm>
- Catechism of the Catholic Church: http://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/ccc_toc.htm

- James Likoudis (polemicist convert from Orthodoxy): <http://credo.stormloader.com/jlindex.htm>
– *Likoudis also has a number of anti-Orthodox books*

- Dave Armstrong (RC apologist): <http://socrates58.blogspot.com/2006/11/orthodoxy-eastern-index-page.html>

C. Online References

- Internet Medieval Sourcebook: <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/sbook.html>
- OrthodoxWiki: <http://www.orthodoxwiki.org/>

The list above is by no means exhaustive, but it represents some of the sources used for putting this presentation together. The reader is admonished to dig deep and focus on primary sources when exploring this subject.