Orthodoxy and Heterodoxy
PART TWO

Roman Catholicism

I. Introduction: Did the Great Schism produce different religions?

II. The Differences in Phronema (Mindset)
   A. Development of Doctrine
   B. Faith and Reason
   C. Spirituality

III. Doctrinal Differences
   A. Papal Dogmas and the Church
      1. Universal Jurisdiction
      2. Papal Infallibility
   B. The Same God?
      1. The Filioque
      2. Divine Simplicity
      3. Created Grace
   C. Salvation
      1. Can Orthodox Christians and other Non-Catholics be saved?
      2. Original Sin
      3. Merit, Satisfaction, Eternal Punishment and Temporal Punishment
      4. Purgatory and Indulgences
      5. Sacraments and Validity

IV. The Grounds of Union
Timeline of Major Dates for Orthodox / Roman Catholic Relations

ca. 37-53 Episcopacy of St. Peter in Antioch.
50 Apostolic Council of Jerusalem overrules St. Peter’s Judaizing.
64 Martyrdom of St. Peter in Rome.
67 Election of St. Linus, first bishop of Rome.
135 First recorded use of title Pope by a Roman bishop (Hyginus).
255 St. Cyprian of Carthage rejects Pope Stephen I’s ruling on the Donatist controversy.
325 Original Nicene Creed ratified at First Ecumenical Council.
330 Founding of Constantinople as New Rome, renaming the city of Byzantium.
357 Pope Liberius signs Semi-Arian creed (possibly under duress).
379 Emperor Gratian permits Roman pope authority over neighboring bishops.
381 Nicene Creed expanded at Second Ecumenical Council.
382 First use of papal title Pontifex Maximus (formerly a pagan religious title reserved to the emperor).
410 Rome sacked by Visigoth invaders.
417 Pope Zosimus waffles on Pelagianism.
451 Fourth Ecumenical Council notes that Rome’s primacy is because it was “the imperial city”; Tome of Pope St. Leo I endorsed by Council after review.
455 Rome sacked by Vandals.
ca. 537 Pope Vigilius allegedly writes letter endorsing Monophysitism.
589 Insertion of Filioque into Nicene Creed by local council in Toledo, Spain.
ca. 590-604 Pope St. Gregory the Great rejects the title of “universal bishop” for any bishop.
680-681 Sixth Ecumenical Council anathematizes Pope Honorius as a Monothelite heretic.
710 Last papal visit to Constantinople until 1967.
ca. 750 Forging of the Donation of Constantine, a false document claiming to be from St. Constantine granting universal secular power to the Pope and his successors.
752 Founding of Papal States (lasting until 1870).
792 Charlemagne accuses “Greeks” of deleting Filioque from original Creed.
800 Usurpation of Western Roman Empire by Charlemagne.
809 Pope Leo III forbids addition of Filioque to Creed and has original Creed in both Greek and Latin inscribed on silver tablets displayed in Rome.
869-870 Council in Constantinople deposes St. Photius the Great.
879-880 Council in Constantinople (endorsed by papacy) reinstates St. Photius and anathematizes any changes to Nicene Creed, including the Filioque.
962 Founding of Holy Roman Empire.
1014 First use of Filioque by Pope of Rome, at coronation of Holy Roman Emperor Henry II.
1054 Excommunication of Ecumenical Patriarch Michael Cerularius by Cardinal Humbertus, papal legate, the conventional date point of the Great Schism. Michael returns the favor by excommunicating the Pope (who had died rendering his legate’s authority null).
1059 Beginning of the use of the term transubstantiation.
1066 Invasion of England by Duke William of Normandy, carrying papal banner and with papal blessing as a crusade against the “errring English church,” engineered by Hildebrand, archdeacon of Rome.
Hildebrand becomes Pope Gregory VII and institutes Gregorian Reforms, the largest increase of papal power in history, including the claim to be able to depose secular rulers.

Pope Gregory VII issues Dictatus papae, an extreme statement of papal power.

Crusades promise salvation to warriors from the West.

Last formal reception of Latins to communion at an Orthodox altar, in Antioch.

Maronites (formerly Monothelite heretics) submit to Rome.

Fourth Crusade sacks Constantinople; Crusaders set up Latin Empire and Patriarchate of Constantinople (lasting until 1261).

Council of Lyons fails to force Orthodox capitulation to papacy.

Last record of Benedictine monastery on Mount Athos.

Papal bull Unam Sanctam declares submission to pope necessary for salvation.

Beginning of Western “Great Schism,” during which there are eventually 3 rival popes.

Councils in Constantinople vindicate Palamite theology of hesychasm against Barlaamist philosophy.

Council of Constance ends Western “Great Schism.”

Council of Florence fails to force Orthodox capitulation to papacy and confesses Purgatory as dogma.

Catholic priest Lorenzo Valla proves Donation of Constantine a forgery.

Fall of Constantinople to Ottoman Turks; numerous Greek scholars flee to West, triggering European Renaissance.

Council of Trent answers charges of Protestant Reformation.

Institution of Gregorian Calendar.

Union of Brest-Litovsk, creation of the Unia (Eastern/Byzantine/Greek Catholics).

Melkite Schism, in which many Antiochian Orthodox become Greek Catholics.

Declaration of Immaculate Conception of Mary as dogma.

Declaration of Papal Infallibility to be dogma at First Vatican Council.

State-sponsored synod held Ukraine dissolves the Union of Brest-Litovsk and integrates the Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church into the Russian Orthodox Church, with Soviet authorities arresting resisters or deporting them to Siberia.

Declaration of Bodily Assumption of Mary as dogma.

Vatican II institutes major reforms, especially liturgical, into Roman Catholic Church.

Mutual lifting of excommunications by Patr. Athenagoras I and Pope Paul VI.

Joint Commission of Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches for Theological Dialogue established.

Pope John Paul II issues Orientale Lumen, encouraging East-West union.

Pope John Paul II apologizes to Orthodox for Fourth Crusade.

Return of relics of Ss. John Chrysostom and Gregory the Theologian returned to Constantinople from Rome (after having been stolen by Crusaders).

Pope Benedict XVI drops title Patriarch of the West.
The Grounds of Union

In order for the Orthodox Church to accept sacramental communion with the Roman Catholic Church, that is, for Roman Catholics to be readmitted into the Orthodox Church, they have to repudiate and reject (not merely brush aside or “theologize around”) the following:

1. Papal Universal Jurisdiction
2. Papal Infallibility
3. Papal Petrine exclusivism (i.e., that only the Pope is Peter’s successor)
4. Development of Doctrine
5. The *Filioque*
6. Original Sin understood as guilt transmitted via “propagation”
7. The Immaculate Conception of Mary
8. Divine Simplicity
9. Merit and Satisfaction soteriology
10. Purgatory and Indulgences
11. Created grace

Roman Catholics would have to accept and fully confess:

1. The authority of Ecumenical Councils over the Pope
2. The Essence/Energies distinction

Roman Catholics would have to restore Orthodox practices (already present for Eastern Catholics):

1. Reconnect Confirmation/Chrismation back to Baptism rather than delaying it
2. Give Holy Communion to all Church members, including infants

In other words, what the Orthodox expect of Roman Catholics is that they become Orthodox again, that they return to the ancient Orthodox faith of the pre-Schism West. They would not have to give up their ancient traditions of worship (though they would probably want to turn the clock back on the liturgical revolution following Vatican II).
Appendix: Further Reading

A. Orthodox Sources

Books


Young, Fr. Alexey. [Various titles, incl. *The Rush to Embrace, The Great Divide and Christianity or Papism*]

Websites


The *Filioque*: http://www.geocities.com/trvalentine/orthodox/filioquemain.html

What are the Differences...?: http://www.ocf.org/OrthodoxPage/reading/ortho_cath.html

The Great Schism: http://www.fatheralexander.org/booklets/english/history_timothy_ware_1.htm#n4

B. Roman Catholic Sources

Vatican Website: http://www.vatican.va/

Vatican Resource Library: http://www.vatican.va/archive/index.htm

Catechism of the Catholic Church: http://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/ccc_toc.htm

James Likoudis (polemicist convert from Orthodoxy): http://credo.stormloader.com/jlindex.htm

– Likoudis also has a number of anti-Orthodox books


C. Online References

Internet Medieval Sourcebook: http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/sbook.html

OrthodoxWiki: http://www.orthodoxwiki.org/

The list above is by no means exhaustive, but it represents some of the sources used for putting this presentation together. The reader is admonished to dig deep and focus on primary sources when exploring this subject.